



government on the web

a report by the comptroller and auditor general

Ordered by the House of Commons to be
printed 13 December 1999

appendix i

study methodology

i.1 The rapid pace of change of Internet developments, their wide impacts on government information and communications technology and the novelty of the organisational issues raised, all presented some difficult challenges. Our approach relied on information gathered from a number of different methods and sources, which were carefully cross-checked using a 'triangulation' method.

Surveys

i.2 We undertook an 'unobtrusive measures' and non-reactive census of all central government Web sites near the start of the study, in November and December 1998. This element encompassed all central government ministerial and non-ministerial departments, Next Steps agencies, and those non-departmental public bodies with executive responsibilities. We assembled the census list from Cabinet Office and other Civil Service and parliamentary sources, and cross-checked our listing with expert interviewees. The complete set of bodies covered is detailed in Figure 39. Because government on the Web policy for Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland bodies will be determined under devolution arrangements by the Scottish Parliament, the Welsh National Assembly and the Northern Ireland Assembly we focused only on UK-wide agencies and on agencies for England. The patterns of Scottish, Welsh and Northern Irish administration are significantly different from those at the UK or England levels, and the scale of agencies there is much smaller. So this limitation also made the population for the study a more coherent group. We defined a coding frame to be used by graduate researchers, each of whom visited the sites being surveyed using the same equipment and the same browser (Netscape version 3) located in an LSE computer classroom. Researchers were carefully briefed on procedures, trained on a pilot set of agency sites, supervised when undertaking their work, and had a percentage of their results cross-checked by other researchers or the main study team. The coding frame focused so far as possible on using objective criteria to assess sites, and we avoided trying to make subjective any judgements or evaluations. The coding frame and the basic data for the census outcomes are in available on the Web for free download at: <http://www.governmentontheweb.org>.

i.3 In May 1999 we mailed a reactive survey to all departmental permanent secretaries and agency chief executives, seeking their views on government on the Web issues. Key results are described above in Part I, and the full questionnaire and basic data responses is available on the Web

for free download at: <http://www.governmentontheweb.org>. The overall response rate to the survey was 70 per cent, a high level given the demands on the time of these very busy officials. We are very grateful to all those who responded for their help. The survey was again designed as a census, using the listing in Figure 39 below. A star (*) following a department or agency name indicates that a response was provided. We have compared carefully the characteristics of the population and of the 70 per cent returns, and they are closely matched.

i.4 One of the pages in the chief executives' survey asked them to nominate an official in their information technology or new media divisions to whom we could send a more detailed follow-up survey by e-mail for completion on the Web. These more specific survey forms and the basic data responses are available on the Web for free download at: <http://www.governmentontheweb.org>. The e-mail forms were despatched in late June 1999 and a 60 per cent response was received (from among agencies responding to the chief executives' survey) by the cut-off date in August. Some agencies returned two separate responses, but most pooled their returns.

i.5 The study design relied on investigating government on the Web issues in depth in two departments, one dealing primarily with ordinary citizens and one with business. Together with colleagues in the National Audit Office and in discussion with a number of departments we selected the Department of Social Security and the Department of Trade and Industry for the main case studies. A number of criteria needed to be reconciled here, including securing a fair distribution of the wider load across departments. We also undertook in-depth work with the Central Information and Technology Unit of the Cabinet Office. We are very grateful to a great many staff in all the departments and their agencies who generously provided their time for interviews, supplied a wide range of data, minutes and documentation, and in some cases allowed us to sit in on relevant meetings. A full list of organisations where we conducted interviews is given in Figure 40. In addition we undertook a wider programme of interviews with agencies outside our case study departments and with some private sector contractors to government on more general government on the Web issues, and sat in on meetings of the Government Internet Forum. Overall we completed 61 interviews with government officials in the UK. In addition a large number of phone and e-mail interviews were undertaken (not listed).

Studies of comparator organisations

i.6 At the beginning of our study we undertook a programme of visits to and interviews with a set of large private sector companies, described in detail in Comparator A. The aim here was to identify elements of good practice which might be applicable in the public sector, and to determine the main trends and most common problems involved in introducing Web-based technologies into large organisations. We are very grateful to all those involved for their help and co-

operation. The interviews and data gathered proved very valuable in pointing to issues for government agencies to tackle over the next few years.

i.7 Throughout the study period we undertook research on patterns of development of government on the Web in three overseas countries, and towards the end of the study period visited each of them and conducted interviews with key staffs. The countries chosen were the United States, Australia and Germany, and full details of the study results are provided in Comparator B.

39 ORGANISATIONS COVERED IN THE CENSUS OF CENTRAL GOVERNMENT WEB SITES AND THE SURVEYS OF CHIEF EXECUTIVES AND IT MANAGERS

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF BODY	CES	IMS
Ministry of Agriculture Fisheries and Food	Ministerial Department	1	1
Central Science Laboratory	Executive Agency	1	1
Centre for Environment, Fisheries & Aqua. Science	Executive Agency	1	1
Intervention Board	Executive Agency	1	0
Meat Hygiene Service	Executive Agency	1	1
Pesticides Safety Directorate	Executive Agency	1	1
Veterinary Laboratories Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Veterinary Medicines Directorate	Executive Agency	1	1
Agricultural Wages Board for England & Wales	Executive Body	1	0
Apple and Pear Research Council	Executive Body	1	0
British Potato Council	Executive Body	1	0
Food from Britain	Executive Body	1	0
Home-Grown Cereals Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Horticultural Development Council	Executive Body	1	1
Horticultural Research International	Executive Body	1	1
Meat and Livestock Commission	Executive Body	0	0
Meat Hygiene Appeals Tribunal	Executive Body	1	0
Milk Development Council	Executive Body	1	1
Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew	Executive Body	1	1
Sea Fish Industry Authority	Executive Body	1	1
UK Register of Organic Food Standards	Executive Body	0	0
Waste Standards Board of the Vintners' Company	Executive Body	0	0
Covent Garden Market Authority	Public Corporation	1	0
Cabinet Office	Ministerial Department	1	1
CCTA	Executive Agency	1	1
Central Office of Information	Executive Agency	1	1
Civil Service College	Executive Agency	1	0
Government Car and Dispatch Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Buying Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Property Advisers to the Civil Estate	Executive Agency	1	0
British Government Panel on Sustainable Devt.	Executive Body	0	0
Civil Service Appeal Board	Executive Body	1	0
Political Honours Scrutiny Committee	Executive Body	0	0
Committee on Standards in Public Life	Executive Body	1	0
Department of Culture Media and Sport	Ministerial Department	0	0
Royal Parks Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Arts Council of England	Executive Body	0	0
British Film Institute	Executive Body	1	0
British Library	Executive Body	1	0

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF BODY	CES	IMS
British Museum	Executive Body	1	1
British Tourist Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Broadcasting Standards Committee	Executive Body	1	0
English Sports Council	Executive Body	1	0
English Tourist Board	Executive Body	0	0
Football Licensing Authority	Executive Body	1	1
GB Sports Council	Executive Body	0	0
Geffrye Museum	Executive Body	1	1
Horniman Museum	Executive Body	1	0
Imperial War Museum	Executive Body	1	1
Millennium Commission	Executive Body	1	1
Museum of London	Executive Body	0	0
Museums and Galleries Commission	Executive Body	0	0
National Film and Television School	Executive Body	0	0
National Gallery	Executive Body	1	1
National Heritage Memorial Fund	Executive Body	1	1
Natural History Museum	Executive Body	1	0
National Lottery Charities Board	Executive Body	1	0
National Maritime Museum	Executive Body	1	1
National Museum of Science and Industry	Executive Body	0	0
National Portrait Gallery	Executive Body	1	1
Registrar of Public Lending Right	Executive Body	1	0
Royal Armouries	Executive Body	1	0
Royal Commission on Historical Manuscripts	Executive Body	1	1
Royal Commission on Hist. Monuments of England	Executive Body	0	0
Sir John Soane's Museum	Executive Body	1	0
Tate Gallery	Executive Body	1	1
English Heritage	Executive Body	0	0
UK Sports Council	Executive Body	1	1
Victoria and Albert Museum	Executive Body	0	0
Wallace Collection	Executive Body	1	0
Historic Royal Palaces	Executive Body	0	0
Radio Authority	Public Corporation	1	0
ITC	Public Corporation	1	1
BBC	Public Corporation	1	0
Channel 4 Television Corp.	Public Corporation	1	0
Ministry of Defence	Ministerial Department	1	1
Armed Forces Personnel Admin. Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Army Base Repair Organisation	Executive Agency	1	0
Army Personnel Centre	Executive Agency	1	0
Army Technical Support Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Army Training and Recruiting Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Defence Analytical Services Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Defence Bills Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Clothing and Textiles Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Codification Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Defence Communication Services Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Defence Dental Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Estates Organisation	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Evaluation and Research Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Defence Intelligence and Security Centre	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Medical Training Organisation	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Postal and Courier Services Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Secondary Care Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Transport and Movements Executive	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Vetting Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Disposal Sales Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Duke of York's Royal Military School	Executive Agency	1	0
Joint Air Reconnaissance Intelligence Centre	Executive Agency	1	0
Logistic Information Systems Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Meteorological Office	Executive Agency	1	0
Medical Supplies Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Military Survey	Executive Agency	1	1
Ministry of Defence Police	Executive Agency	1	0
Hydrographic Office	Executive Agency	0	0

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF BODY	CES	IMS
Naval Aircraft Repair Organisation	Executive Agency	0	0
Naval Bases and Supply Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Naval Manning Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Naval Recruiting and Training Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Pay and Personnel Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Queen Victoria School	Executive Agency	0	0
RAF Logistics Support Services	Executive Agency	0	0
RAF Maintenance Group Defence Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
RAF Personnel Management Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
RAF Signals Engineering Establishment	Executive Agency	0	0
RAF Training Group Defence Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Service Children's Education	Executive Agency	1	0
Ships Support Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Specialist Procurement Services	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Aviation Repair Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Storage and Distribution	Executive Agency	1	0
Procurement Executive	Executive Agency	0	0
Defence Transport & Movements Organisation	Executive Agency	1	0
Defence Housing Executive	Executive Agency	1	0
Fleet Air Arm Museum	Executive Body	1	0
National Army Museum	Executive Body	1	1
Oil and Pipelines Agency	Executive Body	1	0
Royal Air Force Museum	Executive Body	0	0
Royal Marines Museum	Executive Body	0	0
Royal Naval Museum	Executive Body	1	0
Royal Navy Submarine Museum	Executive Body	1	0
Department of the Environment	Ministerial Department	1	1
Transport and the Regions	Ministerial Department	1	1
Forestry Commission	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Driving Standards Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Highways Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Maritime and Coastguard Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Ordnance Survey	Executive Agency	1	1
Planning Inspectorate	Executive Agency	1	0
Queen Elizabeth Conference Centre	Executive Agency	1	0
Vehicle Certification Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Vehicle Inspectorate	Executive Agency	1	1
Rent Office Service	Executive Agency	1	0
Forestry Commission Research Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Audit Commission	Executive Body	1	1
Countryside Commission	Executive Body	1	1
English Partnerships	Executive Body	0	0
Environment Agency	Executive Body	1	0
General Lighthouse Authorities	Executive Body	1	0
Health and Safety Commission	Executive Body	1	0
Health and Safety Executive	Executive Body	1	1
Housing Corporation	Executive Body	0	0
Joint Nature Conservation Committee	Executive Body	1	1
London Pensions Fund Authority	Executive Body	1	1
London Regional Passengers' Committee	Executive Body	1	0
English Nature	Executive Body	1	0
National Forest Company	Executive Body	0	0
Natural Environment Research Council	Executive Body	0	0
Traffic Director for London	Executive Body	1	1
United Kingdom Eco-labelling Board	Executive Body	0	0
British Waterways Board	Nationalised Industry	1	0
Civil Aviation Authority	Nationalised Industry	1	0
London Regional Transport	Nationalised Industry	0	0
Govt. Office for the North East	Government Office for Regions	1	1
Govt. Office for the North West	Government Office for Regions	1	1

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF BODY	CES	IMS
Govt. Office for Yorks & Humber	Government Office for Regions	1	1
Govt. Office for the West Midlands	Government Office for Regions	0	0
Govt. Office for the East Midlands	Government Office for Regions	1	0
Govt. Office for Eastern Region	Government Office for Regions	1	1
Govt. Office for the South West	Government Office for Regions	1	0
Govt. Office for the South East	Government Office for Regions	1	1
Govt. Office for London	Government Office for Regions	1	0
Department for Education and Employment	Ministerial Department	0	0
Office for Standards in Education	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Employment Service	Executive Agency	1	0
Centre for Information on Language Teaching & Research	Executive Body	0	0
Construction Industry Training Board	Executive Body	1	0
Education Assets Board	Executive Body	1	0
Engineering Construction Industry Training Board	Executive Body	1	1
Equal Opportunities Commission	Executive Body	1	0
Further Education Funding Council for England	Executive Body	1	1
Higher Education Funding Council for England	Executive Body	0	0
Investors in People UK	Executive Body	0	0
BECTA	Executive Body	1	0
Qualifications and Curriculum Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Remploy Limited	Executive Body	1	1
Student Loans Company	Executive Body	1	0
Teacher Training Agency	Executive Body	1	1
Foreign and Commonwealth Office	Ministerial Department	1	1
Wilton Park	Executive Agency	0	0
Britain-Russia Centre	Executive Body	1	0
British Association for Central and Eastern Europe	Executive Body	0	0
British Council	Executive Body	1	0
Commonwealth Institute	Executive Body	1	1
Marshall Aid Commemoration Commission	Executive Body	1	0
The Great Britain-China Centre	Executive Body	1	0
Westminster Foundation for Democracy	Executive Body	0	0
Department of Health	Ministerial Department	1	1
Medical Devices Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Medicines Control Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
NHS Estates	Executive Agency	0	0
NHS Pensions Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Central Council for Education & Training in Social Work	Executive Body	1	1
Dental Practice Board	Executive Body	1	1
Eng. Nat. Board for Nursing, Midwifery & Health Visiting	Executive Body	1	1
Health Education Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Medical Practices Committee	Executive Body	0	0
Mental Health Act Commission	Executive Body	1	0
Microbiological Research Authority	Executive Body	0	0
National Biological Standards Board	Executive Body	1	0
National Blood Authority	Executive Body	1	1
National Health Service Litigation Agency	Executive Body	1	0
National Health Service Supplies Authority	Executive Body	0	0
National Radiological Protection Board	Executive Body	1	0
Prescription Pricing Authority	Executive Body	1	0
Public Health Laboratory Service Board	Executive Body	1	1
United Kingdom Transplant Support	Executive Body	1	0

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF BODY	CES	IMS
Home Office	Ministerial Department	1	1
Fire Service College	Executive Agency	1	1
Forensic Science Service	Executive Agency	1	1
HM Prison Service	Executive Agency	1	0
UK Passport Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Probation Service	Executive Agency	1	0
Alcohol Education and Research Council	Executive Body	1	1
Commission for Racial Equality	Executive Body	0	0
Community Development Foundation	Executive Body	1	0
Criminal Cases Review Commission	Executive Body	1	0
Criminal Injuries Compensation Appeals Panel	Executive Body	1	0
Criminal Injuries Compensation Authority	Executive Body	1	0
Criminal Injuries Compensation Board	Executive Body	0	0
Gaming Board for Great Britain	Executive Body	1	1
Horserace Betting Levy Board	Executive Body	1	1
Horserace Totalisator Board	Executive Body	1	0
Office of the Data Protection Registrar	Executive Body	1	0
Parole Board	Executive Body	1	0
Police Compensation Authority	Executive Body	1	0
Department for International Development	Ministerial Department	0	0
Commonwealth Scholarship Commission	Executive Body	1	1
Commonwealth Development Corp.	Public Corporation	1	0
Law Officer's Department	Ministerial Department	1	0
Serious Fraud Office	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Crown Prosecution Service	Executive Agency	1	0
Government Property Lawyers	Executive Agency	0	0
Treasury Solicitor's Department	Executive Agency	0	0
Lord Advocate's Department	Ministerial Department	0	0
Lord Chancellor's Department	Ministerial Department	1	0
Court Service	Executive Agency	1	0
Land Registry	Executive Agency	0	0
Public Record Office	Executive Agency	1	1
Public Trust Office	Executive Agency	1	1
Legal Aid Board	Executive Body	0	0
Civil Justice Council	Executive Body	1	0
Civil Procedure Rule Committee	Executive Body	0	0
Privy Council Office	Ministerial Department	1	0
Department of Social Security	Ministerial Department	1	1
Benefits Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Child Support Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Contributions Agency	Executive Agency	1	0
Information Technology Services Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
War Pensions Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Occupational Pensions Regulatory Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Pensions Compensation Board	Executive Body	1	0
Department of Trade and Industry	Ministerial Department	0	1
Office of Electricity Regulation	Non-ministerial Department	0	0
Office of Fair Trading	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Office of Gas Supply	Non-ministerial Department	1	0
Office of Passenger Rail Franchising	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Office of Telecommunications	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Office of the National Lottery	Non-ministerial Department	1	0

ORGANISATION	TYPE OF BODY	CES	IMS
Office of the Rail Regulator	Non-ministerial Department	0	0
Office of Water Services	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Companies House	Executive Agency	1	1
Employment Tribunal Service	Executive Agency	1	0
Insolvency Service	Executive Agency	0	0
National Weights and Measures Laboratory	Executive Agency	1	1
Patent Office	Executive Agency	1	0
Radiocommunications Agency	Executive Agency	1	1
Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service	Executive Body	0	0
Biotech and Biological Sciences Research Council	Executive Body	1	1
British Hallmarking Council	Executive Body	1	1
Coal Authority	Executive Body	1	1
Council for the Central Laboratory of the Research Councils	Executive Body	1	1
Design Council	Executive Body	1	1
ESRC	Executive Body	1	0
EPSRC	Executive Body	1	1
Gas Consumers' Council	Executive Body	1	0
Low Pay Commission	Executive Body	1	1
Medical Research Council	Executive Body	1	1
Monopolies and Mergers Commission	Executive Body	1	0
National Consumer Council	Executive Body	0	0
National Consumers' Consultative Committee	Executive Body	1	1
National Environment Research Council	Executive Body	0	0
Particle Physics and Astronomy Research Council	Executive Body	1	1
Policyholders' Protection Board	Executive Body	0	0
Post Office Users' National Council	Executive Body	1	0
The New Millennium Experience Company	Executive Body	0	0
The Simpler Trade Procedures Board	Executive Body	1	0
United Kingdom Atomic Energy Authority	Executive Body	1	0
HM Treasury	Ministerial Department	1	1
Charity Commission	Non-ministerial Department	0	0
The Crown Estate	Non-ministerial Department	0	0
HM Customs and Excise	Non-ministerial Department	1	1
Inland Revenue	Non-ministerial Department	1	0
National Debt Office	Non-ministerial Department	1	0
Debt Management Office	Executive Agency	1	0
National Savings	Executive Agency	1	0
Office for National Statistics	Executive Agency	1	1
Royal Mint	Executive Agency	1	0
Valuation Office	Executive Agency	1	1
Scottish Office	Ministerial Department	0	0
Welsh Office	Ministerial Department	1	0
Northern Ireland Office	Ministerial Department	0	0
Financial Services Agency	Non-ministerial Department	0	0
Government Purchasing Agency	Executive Agency	0	0
Communications Electronic Group	Ministerial Department	1	0
Forest Enterprise	Executive Agency	1	1
Forest Service	Executive Agency	1	1
GCHQ	Ministerial Department	1	1
Historic Scotland	Executive Agency	1	1
Security Service	Ministerial Department	1	0

Notes: In the response received columns, CES means 'chief executives' survey' and IMS means 'IT managers' survey'.

40 LIST OF INTERVIEWEES

**Public-Sector Interviews
(number of interviewees)**

Benefits Agency (5)
 Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (2)
 Cabinet Office (1)
 Central Computing and Telecommunications Agency (1)
 Cabinet Office: Central IT Unit (5)
 Central Office for Information (1)
 Child Support Agency (6)
 Companies House (2)
 Department for Social Security HQ (2)
 Department for Social Security Internet Working Group (sat in on meeting)
 Department for Trade and Industry HQ (6)
 Economic and Social Research Council (2)
 Engineering and Physical Science Research Council (3)
 Government Internet Users' Forum (sat in on two day conferences)
 Health and Safety Executive (1)
 Highways Agency (1)
 HM Treasury (2)
 Information Technology Services Agency (7)
 National Citizens Advice Bureau (2)
 Natural Environment Research Council (2)
 Office of Science and Technology (3)
 Particle Physics and Astronomy Research Council (3)
 Patent Office (2)
 War Pensions Agency (2)

Total 61**Private-Sector Interviews**

Barclays Retail Bank (1)
 Barclays Stockbrokers (1)
 British Telecom (1)
 Cable and Wireless (1)
 Cisco (1)
 Citibank (1)
 Cyberia Consultants (2)
 Dell UK (2)
 DHL (1)
 Financial Times (2)
 Glaxo-Wellcome (1)
 Lloyds TSB (1)
 Tesco (1)

Total 16**List of Overseas Interviews**

Australian Attorney General's Office (3)
 Australian CentreLink (3)
 Australian Customs Service (3)
 Australian FedLink (2)
 Australian National Audit Office (2)
 Australian National Office for the Information Economy (2)
 Australian Office for Government On-Line (2)
 Australian Tax Office (1)
 Bundesministerium des Innern (Home Office) (1)
 Bundesministerium fur Arbeit und Sozialordnung (Labour and Social Affairs) (3)
 Bundesministerium fur Bildung und Forschung (Education and Research) (2)
 Bundesministerium fur Familie, Senioren, Frauen und Jugendliche (Family, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth) (1)
 Bundespresseamt (Kanzleramt) (Press Information Office, Chancellor's office) (3)
 Department of Premier and Cabinet, Victoria, Australia (2)
 Employment, Workplace Relations and Small Business Portfolio, Australia (4)
 Melbourne City Council, Victoria, Australia (1)
 Multimedia Victoria, Australia (3)
 Staatskanzlei Nordrhein-Westfalen, Pressestelle (State Chancellery Northrhine-Westphalia) (3)
 US General Accounting Office (2)
 US National Partnership for Re-Inventing Government: Access America (1)
 US Department of Energy (1)
 (also National Partnership for Re-Inventing Government: Best Practices Council)
 Victoria Justice Department, Australia (2)
 Victorian Electoral Commission, Australia (1)

Total 48

A total of 125 people were interviewed in person.